Intervention andReflection: Basic Issues inBioethicsMunson, Ronald
ISBN-13: 9781111186562Table ofContents
Part I:RIGHTS. 1Physicians, Patients, andOthers: Autonomy, Truth-Telling, andConfidentiality. Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: DaxCowart Rejects Treatment--and IsIgnored. Social Context: Autism andVaccination. CasePresentation: Suffer theLittle Children. CasePresentation: HPVVaccine: HopeorHype? Social Context: Placebos andTransparency. Social Context: Health Cops: HowMuchRegulation isTooMuch? Social Context: Medical Tourism. CasePresentation: Healing theHmong. CasePresentation: TheVegan Baby. BRIEFING SESSION: Autonomy. Paternalism. State Paternalism inMedical andHealth Care. Personal Paternalism inMedical andHealth Care. Informed Consent andMedical Treatment. FreeandInformed Consent. Parents andChildren. Pregnancy andAutonomy. Truth-Telling inMedicine. Placebos. Dignity andConsent. Confidentiality (Privacy). Breaching Confidentiality. DutytoWarn? Managed Care. HIPPARegulations. Ethical Theories: Autonomy, Truth-Telling, Confidentiality. READINGS: Section 1:Consent andMedical Treatment. Onora O'Neill: Paternalism andPartial Autonomy. Gerald Dworkin: Paternalism. DaxCowart andRobert Burt: Confronting Death: WhoChooses, WhoControls? ADialogue. Section 2:Truth-Telling andDeception. PLichtenberg, etal.:Ethics ofthePlacebo inClinical Practice. MackLipkin: OnTelling Patients theTruth. Susan Cullen andMargaret Klein: Respect forPatients, Physicians, andtheTruth. Section 3:Confidentiality. MarkSiegler: Confidentiality inMedicine--A Decrepit Concept. Supreme Court ofCalifornia: Decision intheTarasoff Case. Section 4:Children andConsent. Douglas S.Diikema: Parental Refusals ofMedical Treatments: TheHarmPrinciple asThreshold forState Intervention. Jeffrey D.Hordetal.:DoParents HavetheRight toRefuse Standard Treatment ForTheir Child WithFavorable-Prognosis Cancer? Anita Catlin: TheDilemma ofJehovah's Witness Children WhoNeedBlood toSurvive. Eugene Rosam: Reply toAnita Catlin. DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.HPVVaccination Required? 2.WhenPrayer isNotEnough. 3Protecting Against Disease. 4Weight Cops. 5Babyvs.Mom6Pregnancy andAutonomy-In Conflict? 7.IsSomeTruth Better ThantheWhole Truth? 8.WhenDoesNoMeanNo?9.Vampire Confession. 10Whose Decision isIt?2.Research Ethics andInformed Consent. Cases andContexts. Social Context: FaceTransplant: TheDream ofLooking Ordinary. CasePresentation: Abigail Alliance v.FDA:DoTerminally IIIPeople HaveaRight toTakeExperimental Drugs? Social Context: Prisoners asTestSubjects? CasePresentation: Jesse Gelsinger: TheFirst Gene-Therapy Death. Social Context: TheCold-War Radiation Experiments. CasePresentation: TheWillowbrook Hepatitis Experiments. CasePresentation: Echoes ofWillowbrook orTuskegee? Experimenting withChildren. CasePresentation: TheUseofMorally Tainted Sources: ThePernkopf Anatomy. CasePresentation: Stopping theLetrozole Trial: ACaseof"Ethical Overkill"? CasePresentation: BabyFae.BRIEFING SESSION: Clinical Trials. The"Informed" PartofInformed Consent. The"Consent" PartofInformed Consent. Vulnerable Populations. Medical Research andMedical Therapy. Investigators andFinancial Conflict. Placebos andResearch. Therapeutic andNontherapeutic Research. Research Involving Children. Research Involving Prisoners. Research Involving thePoor. Research Involving theTerminally Ill.Research Involving Fetuses. Research Involving Animals. Women andMedical Research. Summary. Ethical Theories: Medical Research, andInformed Consent. Utilitarianism. Kant. Ross. Natural Law.Rawls. READINGS: Section 1:Consent andExperimentation. Stephen Goldby, SaulKrugman, M.HPappworth, andGeoffrey Edsall. TheWillowbrook Letters: Criticism andDefense. PaulRamsey, Judgment onWillowbrook. Principles oftheNuremberg Code. National Commission fortheProtection ofHuman Subjects. Belmont Report. HansJonas. Philosophical Reflections onExperimenting withHuman Subjects. Section 2:TheEthics ofRandomized Clinical Trials. DonMarquis. HowtoResolve anEthical Dilemma Concerning Randomized Clinical Trials. Eugene Passamani, Clinical Trials: AreTheyEthical? Robert Northcott. HowNecessary AreRandomized Controlled Trials? Section 3:Access toExperimental Drugs. Judith Rogers. Majority Opinion inAbigail Alliance v.FDAThomas B.Griffith. Dissenting Opinion inAbigail Alliance v.FDASection 4:Animal Experimentation. Peter Singer, Animal Experimentation. CarlCohen, TheCasefortheUseofAnimals inBiomedical Research. DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.BoydRush: TheFirst Animal-Human Transplant. 2Phase IandConsent. 3Stopping Tamoxifen. 4Clinical Testing inForeign Countries. 5Genuine Consent? 6.WhentheNumbers areSmall, CanaTrial BeEthical? 7.Using NaziData. 8Primate HeadTrauma. PartII:CONTROLS. 3Genetics Control. Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: Genae Girard andGenePatents. CasePresentation: Huntington's Disease-Deadly Disease, Personal Dilemmas. Social Context: Testing forDisease Predisposition-Is itBetter NottoKnow? Social Context: Predictive Genetic Testing-To TestorNottoTest? Social Context: GINA-Genetic Information Nondiscrimination Act.Social Context: WhatAreMyChances? Direct-to-Consumer Genetic Testing. CasePresentation: GeneTherapy--Slowly Delivering onthePromise. Social Context: TheHuman Genome Project--Genes, Diseases, andthePersonal Genome. Social Context: StemCells: TheEndoftheBattle? BRIEFING SESSION: Genetic Intervention: Screening Counseling andDiagnosis. Genetic Disease. Genetic Screening. Genetic Counseling. Prenatal Genetic Diagnosis. Ethical Difficulties withGenetic Intervention. Eugenics. Negative andPositive Eugenics. UseofDesirable GermCells. Ethical Difficulties withEugenics. Genetic Research, Therapy, andTechnology. Recombinant DNA.GeneTherapy. Biohazards. Ethical Difficulties withGenetic Research, Therapy, andTechnology. READINGS: Section 1:Dilemmas ofGenetic Choice. JeffMcMahan: TheMorality ofScreening forDisability. DenaS.Davis: Genetic Dilemmas andtheChild's Right toanOpenFuture. Section 2:Genetic Selection-- ANewEugenics? Julian Savulescu: Procreative Beneficence: WhyWeShould Select theBestChildren. Michael Parker: TheBestPossible Child. Section 3:Genetics andAbortion. Jeffrey R.Botkin: Fetal Privacy andConfidentiality. LeonR.Kass: Implications ofPrenatal Diagnosis fortheHuman Right toLife. Section 4:Embryonic StemCells-End oftheBattle? Insoo Hyun: StemCells FromSinCells: TheEthical Questions. Gerard Magill andWilliam B.Neaves: Ontological andEthical. Implications ofDirect Nuclear Reprogramming. Pontifical Academy forLife: Declaration ontheProduction andtheScientific andTherapeutic UseofHuman Embryonic StemCells. DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.Improving Society OneEmbryo ataTime. 2AChild LikeUs.3Screening forMarriage. 4ADutyNottoReproduce? 5.Justified Test? 6.ADutytoTellorToRemain Silent? 7.Tampering WithHuman Life? 8.Embryonic StemCells. 4Reproductive Control. Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: TheOctomom andtheMcCaughey Septuplets: ThePerils ofMultiple Pregnancy. Social Context: Shopping theSperm Supermarket. Social Context: ThePrice ofEggs: EggDonors: Rewards, Risks, andExploitation. Social Context: Advances inReproductive Cloning. CasePresentation: Louise Brown: TheFirst "Test-Tube Baby." CasePresentation: Savior Sibling. CasePresentation: TheCalvert Case: AGestational Surrogate Changes HerMind. Social Context: Postmenopausal Motherhood. CasePresentation: BabyMandMaryBethWhitehead: Surrogate Pregnancy inCourt. BRIEFING SESSION: Techniques ofAssisted Reproduction. IVF,GIFT, ZIFT, IVCULER, PZDICSI, DNATransfer, CDandlUI.NeedandSuccess Rates. Costs. Drawbacks. Potential RisktoChild. Multiple Births. Embryos, Eggs, andTransplants. Gestational Surrogates andDonor Ova.Criticisms ofAssisted Reproduction Practices. Benefits ofIVFandOther Forms ofAssisted Reproduction. Ethical andSocial Difficulties. Incest Potential. Eugenics. Weakening ofFamily. Attitudes ofIVFChildren. Cloning andTwinning. Artificial Insemination. TheProcedure. Reasons forSeeking Artificial Insemination. Sperm Donors. Issues inArtificial Insemination. OvaDonors. Surrogate Pregnancy. Ethical Theories andReproductive Control. READINGS: Section I:Assisted Reproduction andtheLimits ofAutonomy. Howard Minkoff andJeffrey Ecker. TheOctomom andtheFertility Specialists. BSolberg. Getting Beyond theWelfare oftheChild inAssisted Reproduction. Cynthia B.Cohen, 'Give MeChildren orIShall Die!' NewReproductive Technologies andHarmtoChildren. Gillian Hanscombe, TheRight toLesbian Parenthood. Congregation fortheDoctrine oftheFaith. Instruction onRespect forHuman LifeinitsOrigin. Section 2:Savior Siblings. David King: WhyWeShould NotPermit Embryos toBeSelected asTissue Donors. SSheldon andS.Wilkinson: Should Selecting Savior Siblings BeBanned? Section 3:Human Reproductive Cloning. LeonKass: TheWisdom ofRepugnance. Carson Strong: TheEthics ofHuman Reproductive Cloning. Section 4:Surrogate Pregnancy. Bonnie Steinbock, Surrogate Motherhood asPrenatal Adoption. Elizabeth S.Anderson, IsWomen's Labor aCommodity? DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.Child ofaCivil Union. 2Donor Responsibility. 3Looking fortheFamily Tree. 4Embryo =Person? 5.Allowable Discrimination? 6.TheAmbiguous Status ofSurrogacy. 7JustaMatter ofAutonomy? 8.Inherently Wrong orJustImpracticable? 9.ThePossibility ofImpairment. PartIII:TERMINATIONS. 5Abortion. Cases andContexts. Social Context: TheConflict Begins: Roev.Wade. CasePresentation: WhenAbortion wasIllegal--Mrs. Sherri Finkbine andtheThalidomide Tragedy. Social Context: AStatistical Profile ofAbortion intheUnited States. Social Context: TheMorning-After Pills (Plan BandEllen)--Emergency Contraception andPolitics. Social Context: "TheAbortion Pill." Social Context: The"Partial-Birth Abortion" Controversy. Social Context: Supreme Court Abortion Decisions After Roev.Wade. BRIEFING SESSION: Human Development andAbortion. TheStatus oftheFetus. Pregnancy, Abortion, andtheRights ofWomen. Therapeutic Abortion. Abortion andtheLaw.Ethical Theories andAbortion. READINGS: Section 1:Abortion andthe"Deprivation ofFutures" Argument. DonMarquis: WhyAbortion IsImmoral. MarkT.Brown: TheMorality ofAbortion andtheDeprivation ofFutures. Section 2:Abortion andtheStatus oftheFetus: TheClassic Arguments. JohnT.Noonan, Jr.:AnAbsolute Value inHistory. Judith Jarvis Thomson: ADefense ofAbortion. MaryAnneWarren: OntheMoral andLegal Status ofAbortion. Section 3:Emergency Contraception andProfessional Responsibilities. Robert F.Card: Conscientious Objection andEmergency Contraception. DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.Emergency Contraception. 2After theConcert. 3AProcedure byAnother Name. 4APregnant Mental Child. 5Fetal Reduction. 6AFamily Tragedy. 7Unexpected News. 8AMatter ofConvenience. 9Whose Life? 10.Reducing Abortion byMaking Abortion Legal? 6.Treating orTerminating: TheDilemma ofImpaired Infants. Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: TheAgony ofBente Hindriks. Social Context: TheDilemma ofExtreme Prematurity. CasePresentation: BabyOwens--Down Syndrome andDuodenal Atresia. Social Context: TheBabyDoeCases. CasePresentation: BabyK--AnAnencephalic Infant andaMother's Request. BRIEFING SESSION: Genetic andCongenital Impairments. Specific Impairments. DownSyndrome. Spina Bifida. Hydrocephaly. Anencephaly. Esophageal Atresia. Duodenal Atresia. Problems ofExtreme Prematurity. Testing forImpairments. Ethical Theories andtheProblem ofBirth Impairments. Envoi. READINGS: Section 1:TheGroningen Protocol. James Lemuel Smith: TheGroningen Protocol; TheWhyandtheWhat. ABJotkowitz andS.Glick: TheGroningen Protocol: Another Perspective. Section 2:TheAshely Treatment. Ashley's MomandDad:The"Ashley Treatment." SMatthew Liao, Julian Savulescu, andMarkSheehan: TheAshley Treatment: BestInterests, Convenience, andParental Decision Making. Section 3:TheStatus ofImpaired Infants. JohnA.Robertson: Examination ofArguments inFavor ofWithholding Ordinary Medical CarefromDefective Infants. HTristram Engelhardt, Jr.:Ethical Issues inAiding theDeath ofYoung Children. Allison Davis: Right toLifeoftheHandicapped. DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.Doing theRight Thing? 2.NoFood, NoWater? 3.Murder orTemporary Insanity? 4.TheMessenger Case. 5Another Ashley? 6.Pointless Suffering? 7.Euthanasia andAssisted Suicide. Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: Karen Quinlan--The Debate Begins. Social Context: WhentheDiagnosis isDeath. CasePresentation: Elizabeth Bouvia's Demand toStarve--Request forAssisted Suicide? Social Context: TheCruzan Case--The Supreme Court Upholds theRight toDie.CasePresentation: Terri Schiavo. CasePresentation: JackKevorkian--Moral Leader orDr.Death? Social Context: Assisted Suicide--The Oregon Experience. CasePresentation: TheAwakening-A Brief Miracle. BRIEFING SESSION: Active andPassive Euthanasia. Voluntary, Involuntary, andNonvoluntary Euthanasia. Defining "Death." Advance Directives. Ethical Theories andEuthanasia. READINGS: Section 1:TheKilling-Letting DieDistinction. James Rachels: Active andPassive Euthanasia. Winston Nesbitt: IsKilling NoWorse ThanLetting Die?Section 2:TheCaseagainst Allowing Euthanasia andAssisted Suicide. JGay-Williams: TheWrongfulness ofEuthanasia. Daniel Callahan: WhenSelf-Determinism RunsAmok. Section 3:TheCaseforAllowing Euthanasia andAssisted Suicide. JohnLachs: WhenAbstract Moralizing RunsAmok. Peter Singer: Voluntary Euthanasia: AUtilitarian Perspective. Section 4:Deciding fortheIncompetent. Supreme Court ofNewJersey: IntheMatter ofKaren Quinlan. DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.TheTimothy Quill Case. 2WhatWould HeWant? 3.TheBartling Case. 4Angel ofMercy? 5.Dutch Practices. PartIV:RESOURCES. 8Organ Transplants andScarce Medical Resources. Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: DidSteve JobsCheat? CasePresentation: ThePrisoner WhoNeeded aHeart. CasePresentation: Playing GodwithDialysis. CasePresentation: Transplants fortheMentally Impaired? Social Context: Acquiring andAllocating Transplant Organs. CasePresentation: TheDrugLottery--The Betaseron Shortage. BRIEFING SESSION: Transplants, Kidneys, andMachines. Controlling Rejection. Allocation andScarcity. Seattle andKidney Machines. Dialysis Costs andDecisions. Microallocation vs.Macroallocation. Ethical Theories andtheAllocation ofMedical Resources. READINGS: Section 1:WhoDeserves Transplant Organs? Jacob M.Appel: Wanted DeadorAlive? Kidney. Transplantation inInmates Awaiting Execution. Robert M.Sade: ThePrisoners' Dilemma: Should Convicted. Felons HavetheSameAccess toHealth CareasOrdinary Citizens? CarlCohen et.al,Alcoholics andLiver Transplantation. Section 2:Acquiring Transplant Organs. Ronald Munson: TheDonors' Right toTakeaRisk. Janet Radcliffe-Richards, etal.:TheCaseforAllowing Organ Sales. Kishore D.Phadke andUrmila Anandh: Refuse toSupport theIllegal Organ Trade. Aaron Spital andCharles A.Erin: Conscription ofCadaveric Organs. Section 3:Allocation Principles. George J.Annas, TheProstitute, thePlayboy, andthePoet. Ezekial J.Emaneuel andAlanWertheimer: WhoShould GetInfluenza Vaccine WhenNotAllCan?DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.First-Come, First-Served? 2.Robbing theDead? 3.Taking aChance forLove. 4Buying aLiver. 5Selling aKidney. 6Lifestyle Factors. 7HowManyLivers AreFair? 8.WhoGetstheVentilators? 9.Distributing Health Care. Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: TheWayitwas--Robert Ingram Can?t Afford tobeSick. Social Context: Affordable CareAct.Social Context: InCrisis Mode--Background toHealth CareReform. BRIEFING SESSION: Recognizing aNeed, NotaRight. Claim-Rights, Legal Rights, andStatutory Rights. Moral Rights. Political Rights. Health CareasaRight. Objections. READINGS: Section 1:Right toHealth Care. President's Commission: Ethical Framework forAccess toHealth Care. HTristram Engelhardt, Jr.:Rights toHealth Care, Social Justice, andFairness intheFaceofFinitude. KaiNielsen: Autonomy, Equality, andaJustHealth CareSystem. Section 2:Equality andHealth Care. Norman Daniels: Equal Opportunity andHealth Care. Gopol Sreenivassan: Health CareandEquality ofOpportunity. DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.Insurance NotRequired. 2Liver Transplant. 3Custodial Care. 4NottheBestOption. PartV:CHALLENGES. 10Women andMedicine. Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: Angela Carder?s Ordeal. Social Context: Gender Exceptionalism: IsMen's Health Being Neglected? Social Context: Mammograms: TheContinuing Debate. Social Context: Pregnancy, Drugs, andtheLaw.BRIEFING SESSION: Women Excluded. Include Women, Study Women. Women-Specific Studies. Equivalent Care. Women Shortchanged. Office ofWomen's Health. Office ofMen's Health? Women, Pregnancy, andSociety. Outcome. READINGS: Section 1:Women andPregnancy. JohnA.Robertson andJoseph D.Schulman: Pregnancy andPrenatal HarmtoOffspring. Howard Minkoff andLynnM.Paltrow: TheRights of"Unborn Children" andtheValue ofPregnant Women. Section 2:Gender andFairness. AkiTsuchiya andAlanWilliams: A'Fair Innings" Between theSexes: AreMenBeing Treated Inequitably? American College ofObstetrics and:Research Involving Women Gynecologists. DECISION SCENARIOS: Pregnancy andClinical Trials. Lumpectomy vs.Mastectomy. AMammogram toFeelSafe. Prostate Cancer andFairness. Tabita Bricci isTaken toCourt. 11African Americans andMedicine. Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: BadBlood, BadFaith--The Tuskegee Syphilis Study. Social Context: Race-Based Medicine? Social Context: IsHealth About Status, NotRace? BRIEFING SESSION: Special Claim byAfrican-Americans. African-Americans andHealth Care. HIV/AIDS. Black/White Treatment Differences. WhytheGap?TheTuskegee Effect. Clinical Trials. Organ Transplants. Closing theGap.READINGS: Section 1:Race, Research. andMedicine. Armond Marie Leroi: AFamily TreeinEvery Gene. Patricia A.King: TheDangers ofDifference: Legacy oftheTuskegee Syphilis Study. Section 2:Taking RaceintoAccount. Annette Dula: Toward anAfrican-American Perspective onBioethics. HJackGeiger: TheDemise ofAffirmative Action andtheFuture ofHealth Care. DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.Tuskegee Effect. 2Racial-Differences Research. 3Designated Donor byRace. 4Social Construction. 5Cultural Competence. 12Epidemic! AIDSandHIV.Cases andContexts. CasePresentation: Darren Chiacchia--Criminal orVictim? CasePresentation: TheWayitwas--Tod Thompson, Dallas 1984. Social Context: TheNightmare Begins--Discovering AIDS. Social Context: Pandemic--AIDS Worldwide. Social Context: Testing AIDSDrugs intheThird World. Social Context: Origin oftheAIDSVirus. Social Context: Searching fortheAIDSVaccine. BRIEFING SESSION: AIDS/HIV: TheDisease andtheVirus. HIVTests. AIDSatBay.Potential forNewDrug. USEpidemic inProfile. Death Rate. Infection Rates. Protease Inhibitors andHAART. Treatment Limits. Costs. READINGS: Section 1:Confidentiality andResponsibility. Elliot D.Cohen: Lethal Sex:Conditions ofDisclosure inCounseling Sexually Active Clients withHIV.Bernard Rabinowitz: TheGreat Hijack. Section 2:AIDSTrials inAfrica. George 1.Annas andMichael AGrodin: Human Rights andMaternal-Fetal HIVTransmission Prevention Trials inAfrica. Danstan Bagenda andPhilla Musoke-Mudido: We?re Trying toHelpOurSickest People, NotExploit Them. DECISION SCENARIOS: 1.DutytoWarn. 2DutytoViolate Confidentiality? 3.Mandatory Testing, Mandatory Treatment? 4.Registering theHIV-Positive. 5Cultures inConflict. 6Tuskegee intheCongo? PartVI:FOUNDATIONS OFBIOETHICS: ETHICAL THEORIES, MORAL PRINCIPLES, ANDMEDICAL DECISIONS. 13Basic Ethical Theories. Utilitarianism. ThePrinciple ofUtility. ActandRuleUtilitarianism. Preference Utilitarianism. Difficulties withUtilitarianism. Kant's Ethics. TheCategorical Imperative. Another Formulation. Duty. Kant's Ethics intheMedical Context. Difficulties withKantian Ethics. Ross's Ethics. Moral Properties andRules. Actual Duties andPrima Facie Duties. Ross's Ethics intheMedical Context. Difficulties withRoss's Moral Rules. Rawls's Theory ofJustice. TheOriginal Position andthePrinciples ofJustice. Rawls's Theory ofJustice intheMedical. Context. Difficulties withRawls's Theory. Natural LawEthics andMoral Theology. Purposes, Reasons, andtheMoral LawasInterpreted byRoman Catholicism. Applications ofRoman Catholic Moral-Theological Viewpoints intheMedical Context. Difficulties withNatural LawEthics andMoral Theology. 14Major Moral Principles. ThePrinciple ofNonmaleficence. ThePrinciple ofBeneficence. ThePrinciple ofUtility. Principles ofDistributive Justice. ThePrinciple ofEquality. ThePrinciple ofNeed. ThePrinciple ofContribution. ThePrinciple ofEffort. ThePrinciple ofAutonomy. Autonomy andActions. Autonomy andOptions. Autonomy andDecision Making. Restrictions onAutonomy. Theories Without Principles. Virtue Ethics. TheVirtues. Virtue Ethics intheMedical Context. Difficulties withVirtue Ethics. CareEthics. Values, NotPrinciples. CareEthics intheMedical Context. Difficulties withCareEthics. Feminist Ethics. Feminist Ethics intheMedical Context. Difficulties withFeminist Ethics. Retrospect.